# **Docket Sheet**

Case Description
Case ID: 201100876

Case Caption: IN RE: CANVASS OF ABSENTEE & MAIL-IN BALLOTS 2020

Filing Date: Tuesday, November 10th, 2020

Court: PETITIONS Location: City Hall Jury: NON JURY

Case Type: ELECTION MATTERS

ORDER ENTERED - FINAL DISPOS Status:

#### Related Cases

No related cases were found.

#### Case Event Schedule

No case events were found.

#### Case Motions

No motions were found.

#### Case Parties

Seq #	Assoc	Expn Date		Name
1			ATTORNEY FOR PETITIONER	KERNS ESQ, LINDA A
Address:	1420 LOCUST STREET SUITE 200 PHILADELPHIA PA 19102 (215)731-1400	Aliases:	none	
10			ATTORNEY FOR RESPONDENT	ELIBET I VDIA
	1515 ARCH ST	Aliases:		FURST, LTDIA
	15TH FLOOR PHILADELPHIA PA 19102 (215)683-3573			
11			ATTORNEY FOR RESPONDENT	FIELD, BENJAMIN H
Address:	DEPUTY CITY SOLICITOR CITY OF PHILADELPHIA LAW DEPT. 1515 ARCH STREET, 17TH FLOOR PHILADELPHIA PA 19102 (215)683-5024	Aliases:	none	
12	9		ATTORNEY FOR INTERVENOR	WILLIAMS KAHLIL C
	1735 MARKET ST	Aliases:		
ruur ess.	51ST FLOOR PHILADELPHIA PA 19103 (215)864-8346	rinases.	none	
13	9		ATTORNEY FOR INTERVENOR	MCDONALD, MICHAEL R
Address:	1735 MARKET STREET FL 51 PHILADELPHIA PA 19103 (215)864-8425	Aliases:		,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,
14	10		ATTORNEY FOR RESPONDENT	HANCLEVECO MICHELE D
	HANGLEY ARONCHICK SEGAL PUDLIN	-	ATTORNEY FOR RESPONDENT	HANGLET ESQ, MICHELE D
	ONE LOGAN SQUARE 27TH FL PHILADELPHIA PA 19103 (215)568-6200			
15			ATTORNEY FOR RESPONDENT	COIT, JOHN G
Address:	1245 LOMBARD STREET PHILADELPHIA PA 19147 (215)568-6200	Aliases:	none	
			DETUTIONED	DOMALD LEDUNG FOR PREGIDENT BY
Addrose:	C/O LINDA A. KERNS, ESQUIRE	Aliases:	PETITIONER	DONALD J TRUMP FOR PRESIDENT INC
Auuress:	COLLINDA A. KERNS, ESQUIKE SUITE 200 PHILADELPHIA PHILADELPHIA PA 19102	Anases:	none	
3			PETITIONER	ELKIN, ELIZABETH
Address:	2047 NAUDAIN STREET PHILADELPHIA PA 19102	Aliases:	none	
4	1/		DECRONDENT	DEELEV LICA
Address:	CITY HALL	Aliases:	RESPONDENT	DEELEY, LISA
Additess.	JFK BLVD PHILADELPHIA PA 19102	Anases.	none	
5	10		RESPONDENT	BOARD OF ELECTIONS
	CITY HALL	Aliases:		DOMED OF ELECTIONS
auui CSS:	PHILADELPHIA PA 19102	Allases:	none	
6	10		RESPONDENT	SCHMIDT, AL
0		111	IKEST ONDEN I	DCIIVIIDI, AL

	CITY HALL PHILADELPHIA PA 19102	Alia	ses:	none	
7		10		RESPONDENT	SABIR, OMAR
	CITY HALL PHILADELPHIA PA 19102	Alia	ses:	none	
8				JUDGE	CRUMLISH III, JAMES
	CITY HALL PHILADELPHIA PA 19107	Alia	ses:	none	
9				ATTORNEY FOR INTERVENO	OR VAHEY MATTHEWIAN
Address:	BALLARD SPAHR LLP 1735 MARKET ST 51ST FLOOR PHILADELPHIA PA 19103 (215)864-8485	Alia	ses:	none	

#### **Docket Entries**

Filing Date/Time	Docket Type	Filing Party	Disposition Amount	Approval/ Entry Date	
0-NOV-2020 1:09 PM	ACTIVE CASE			11-NOV-2020 08:17 AM	
Docket Entry:	E-Filing Number: 2011016980				
10-NOV-2020 11:09 PM	1 - COMMENCEMENT BY PETITION	KERNS ESQ, LINDA A		11-NOV-2020 08:17 AM	
Documents:	Final Cover			0011711111	
	PETITION FOR ELECTION MATTERS FILED.				
·					
10-NOV-2020 11:09 PM	2 - PETITION FILED	KERNS ESQ, LINDA A		11-NOV-2020 08:17 AM	
Documents:	cuments: Notice of Appeal via Petition for Review of County BOE Decision - Category5.pdf Elections, Meeting of the Commissioners -transcript.pdf				
Docket Entry:	97-20110897 (FILED ON BEHALF OF DONALD J. TRUMP FOR	PRESIDENT, INC., ELIZABETH ELKI	N.)		
11-NOV-2020 08:39 AM	MOTION ASSIGNED			11-NOV-2020 08:39 AM	
Docket Entry:	97-20110897 PETITION FILED ASSIGNED TO JUDGE: CRUML	ISH, JAMES . ON DATE: NOVEMBER	11, 2020		
11-NOV-2020 06:01 PM	LISTED FOR HEARING			11-NOV-2020 06:01 PM	
Docket Entry:	97-20110897				
11-NOV-2020	3 - SCHEDULING ORDER ISSUED			11-NOV-2020	
06:01 PM				12:00 AM	
Documents:	SASOI_6.pdf		T 40 00 414 BY TYPE 1 40 TYPE 1	a a t in min a a t t	
Docket Entry:	97-20110897 A HEARING ON THE ABOVE APPEAL IS SCHED PHILADELPHIA MUNICIPAL COURT TRAFFIC BUILDING, 81				
11-NOV-2020 06:01 PM	NOTICE GIVEN UNDER RULE 236			11-NOV-2020 06:14 PM	
Docket Entry:	NOTICE GIVEN ON 11-NOV-2020 OF SCHEDULING ORDER IS	SSUED ENTERED ON 11-NOV-2020.			
12-NOV-2020 02:56 PM	4 - ENTRY OF APPEARANCE	FURST, LYDIA		13-NOV-2020 09:01 AM	
Documents:	EOA LF BF 201100876.pdf	T.	1		
	ENTRY OF ADDEAD ANCE OF LYDIA FIRST AND DENIAMIN II FIELD FILED ON DELIALE OF OMAD SADID ALSCHMINT DOADD OF				
Docket Entry:		I H FIELD FILED. (FILED ON BEHALF	OF OMAR SABIR, AL SCHMII	DT, BOARD OF	
12-NOV-2020		FURST, LYDIA	OF OMAK SABIR, AL SCHMII	13-NOV-2020 09:01 AM	
12-NOV-2020	ELECTIONS AND LISA DEELEY)  CITY CHARGE SUBSEQUENT FILINGS	`	OF OMAR SABIR, AL SCHMII	13-NOV-2020	
12-NOV-2020 02:56 PM	ELECTIONS AND LISA DEELEY)  CITY CHARGE SUBSEQUENT FILINGS	`	OF OMAR SABIR, AL SCHMII	13-NOV-2020	
12-NOV-2020 02:56 PM <b>Docket Entry:</b> 12-NOV-2020	ELECTIONS AND LISA DEELEY)  CITY CHARGE SUBSEQUENT FILINGS	`	OF OMAR SABIR, AL SCHMII	13-NOV-2020	
12-NOV-2020 02:56 PM Docket Entry: 12-NOV-2020 04:05 PM	ELECTIONS AND LISA DEELEY)  CITY CHARGE SUBSEQUENT FILINGS  None.	FURST, LYDIA	OF OMAR SABIR, AL SCHMII	13-NOV-2020 09:01 AM	
12-NOV-2020 02:56 PM Docket Entry: 12-NOV-2020 04:05 PM	ELECTIONS AND LISA DEELEY)  CITY CHARGE SUBSEQUENT FILINGS  None.  5 - ENTRY OF APPEARANCE	FURST, LYDIA  VAHEY, MATTHEW IAN  ILIL C WILLIAMS AND MATTHEW IA		13-NOV-2020 09:01 AM 13-NOV-2020 09:01 AM	
12-NOV-2020 02:56 PM Docket Entry: 12-NOV-2020 04:05 PM Documents:	ELECTIONS AND LISA DEELEY)  CITY CHARGE SUBSEQUENT FILINGS  None.  5 - ENTRY OF APPEARANCE  201100876 - EOA.pdf  ENTRY OF APPEARANCE OF MICHAEL R MCDONALD, KAH	FURST, LYDIA  VAHEY, MATTHEW IAN  ILIL C WILLIAMS AND MATTHEW IA		13-NOV-2020 09:01 AM 13-NOV-2020 09:01 AM	

Documents:	201100876 - Petition to Intervene and Order - Philadelphia Co 201100876 - Memo in Support of Petition to Intervene - Philad 201100876 - Proposed Answer - Philadelphia County - Catego Motion CoverSheet Form	delphia County - Category 5.pdf		
Docket Entry:	52-20111052 PETITION TO INTERVENE (FILED ON BEH.	ALF OF DNC SERVICES CORP. / DEMOC	RATIC NATIONAL COMMITTEE	)
12-NOV-2020 08:13 PM	7 - ENTRY OF APPEARANCE	HANGLEY ESQ, MICHELE D		13-NOV-2020 09:02 AM
Documents:	2020-11-12 - Entry - 876.pdf			
Docket Entry:	ENTRY OF APPEARANCE OF MICHELE D HANGLEY A	ND JOHN G COIT FILED. (FILED ON BEH	ALF OF BOARD OF ELECTIONS	)
12-NOV-2020 09:35 PM	8 - ACCEPTANCE OF SERVICE FILED	KERNS ESQ, LINDA A		13-NOV-2020 09:02 AM
Documents:	Certificate of Service for 201100876.pdf			
Docket Entry:	SERVICE OF APPEALS FROM BOARD OF ELECTIONS I ELIZABETH ELKIN AND DONALD J. TRUMP FOR PRES		LD ESQ. ON 11/12/2020 FILED. (I	FILED ON BEHALF OF
12-NOV-2020 09:35 PM	9 - ANSWER (MOTION/PETITION) FILED	VAHEY, MATTHEW IAN		13-NOV-2020 09:10 AM
Documents:	Opposition to Petition for Review.pdf Motion CoverSheet Form		,I	ı
Docket Entry:	97-20110897 ANSWER IN OPPOSITION OF PETITION FIL	ED. (FILED ON BEHALF OF DNC SERVI	CES CORP. / DEMOCRATIC NAT	IONAL COMMITTEE)
13-NOV-2020 07:52 AM	10 - BRIEF	HANGLEY ESQ, MICHELE D		13-NOV-2020 09:04 AM
Documents:	Philadelphia County Board of Elections Response.pdf			
Docket Entry:	BRIEF FILED. (FILED ON BEHALF OF BOARD OF ELEC	TIONS)		
13-NOV-2020 04:21 PM	11 - ORDER ENTERED - FINAL DISPOS	CRUMLISH III, JAMES		13-NOV-2020 04:21 PM
Documents:	ORDRF_16.pdf		II.	
Docket Entry:	97-201 10897 UPON CONSIDERATION OF PETITIONER E THE DECISION OF THE PHILADELPHIA COUNTY BOAI AND THE SUBMISSIONS ON BEHALF OF INTERVENOR COUNSEL, IT APPEARING THAT PETITIONER HAS PR PURSUANT TO 25 PA. C.S.A. §3146(G)(6), IT FURTHER THERE IS EVIDENCE OF FRAUD OR THAT THE BALLO WAS ISSUED, AND IT FURTHER APPEARING THAT PE OF THE BALLOTS, AND THE COURT FINDING THAT TI CHALLENGE" PURSUANT TO 25 PA. C.S.A. §3146.8 IS MERITLESS OBJECTION), THE COURT FINDING THAT TI CHALLENGE PURSUANT TO 25 PA. C.S.A. §3146.8 IS MERITLESS OBJECTION), THE COURT FINDS AS FOLL ELECTIONS TO COUNT THE VOTES REPRESENTED IN OUTER ENVELOPE CONTAINS THE ELECTOR'S SIGNA DO NOT HAVE THE ELECTOR'S NAME PRINTED UNDE OF STATE OF THE COMMONWEALTH CONTAINS A DI THE ELECTOR TO SIGN THE DECLARATION, BUT MAI CODE PROVIDES THAT A VOTER SHALL "FILL OUT, D THE CODE IS NOT A DEFINED TERM AND IS AMBIGU ADDRESS ON THE PRE-PRINTED EXTERIOR ENVELOP ADDRESS ARE REQUIREMENTS NECESSARY TO PREV IN THIS CATEGORY WERE TIMELY RECEIVED. 8. THE THE COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS TO MAKE SUCH COURT ORDERS AND DECREES THAT THE PETITION I PHILADELPHIA COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS IN C. ELECTOR'S SIGNATURE, HAND-WRITTEN ADDRESS A UNDER THE SIGNATURE IS AFFIRMED AS IN ACCORE INTERPRETING THE CODEBY THE COURT - CRUMI	RD OF ELECTIONS, THE RESPONSE OF IS, DNA SERVICES CORP/DEMOCRATIC  PERLY AND TIMELY SOUGHT REVIEW APPEARING THAT PETITIONER IS NOT TIS IN QUESTION WERE NOT FILLED OU ITITIONER DOES NOT ALLEGE FRAUD O HE INTERVENOR'S OBJECTION TO THE A MISCHARACTERIZATION OF THE AB OWS: 1. PETITIONER ASSERTS A CHALL THE GROUPING DESIGNATED CATEGO TURE, THE DATE AND THE ELECTOR'S IR THE SIGNATURE. 2. THE ENVELOPE I RECTION IN THE FORM OF A CHECKLIS. KES NO MENTION OF FILLING OUT THE ATE AND SIGN THE DECLARATION" ON DUS. 5. THE PRE-PRINTED BALLOT ALR E. 6. NEITHER A DATE NOR THE ELECT TENT FRAUD. 7. THE PETITIONER CONC ELECTION CODE DIRECTS THE COURT DECREE AS RIGHT AND JUSTICE MAY SO DENIED. THE COURT FURTHER ORDE ANVASSING AND COUNTING 533 ABSEI ND DATE ON THE DECLARATION ENVI	THE PHILADELPHIA COUNTY BY NATIONAL COMMITTEE AND OF THE DECISION OF THE BOOK CONTENDING THAT THERE H. IT BY THE ELECTOR IN WHOSE RIRREGULARITY IN THE CAN CONSIDERATION OF THE APPEOVER-REFERENCED REVIEW (A. LENGE TO THE DECISION OF THE ADDRESS FILLED OUT IN THE PROVIDED TO THE ELECTOR FIST ON THE BACK OF THE ENVELOATE OF THE OUTER ENVELOATE, A THE ADDRESS FILLED OUT IN THE CAN THE OUTER ENVELOPE. 4. THE ADDRESS FILLED OUT IN THE ELECTO OR'S FILLING OUT OF THE PRING THE FORMATION OF SHELING OUT OF THE PRING EDES THAT ALL BALLOTS BY OF COMMON PLEAS IN CONSI REQUIRE. 25 PA. C.S.A. ŧ3157. ERS AND DECREES THAT THE INSTENDED THE PRINGE STREAD OF THE PRINGEN SHE AND MAIL-IN BALLOTS CELOPE BUT MISSING THE HAND	OARD OF ELECTIONS THE ARGUMENTS OF ARD OF ELECTIONS AS BEEN FRAUD, THAT ENAME THE BALLOT VASS AND COUNTING AL AS AN "ELIGIBILITY ND THEREFORE A HE BOARD OF VITS ON WHICH THE SPACE PROVIDED BUT ROM THE SECRETARY LOPE THAT DIRECTS DN. 3. THE ELECTION E TERM "FILL OUT" IN RYS NAME AND VITED NAME OR OF THE A QUALIFIED ELECTOR DERING APPEALS FROM WHEREFORE, THE DICONTAINING THE O-PRINTED NAME O-PRINTED NAME O-PRINTED NAME
13-NOV-2020 04:21 PM	NOTICE GIVEN UNDER RULE 236			13-NOV-2020 04:36 PM
Docket Entry:	NOTICE GIVEN ON 13-NOV-2020 OF ORDER ENTERED	- FINAL DISPOS ENTERED ON 13-NOV-2	020.	
14-NOV-2020 06:23 PM	12 - APPEAL TO COMMONWEALTH COURT	KERNS ESQ, LINDA A		15-NOV-2020 10:31 AM
Documents:	Notice of Appeal attach 876.pdf affidavit of service.pdf			
Docket Entry:	NOTICE OF APPEAL FROM THE DECISION DATED 11/1 FILED. (FILED ON BEHALF OF ELIZABETH ELKIN AND	4/2020 AND DOCKETED ON 11/13/2020 B DONALD J TRUMP FOR PRESIDENT IN	Y JUDGE CRUMLISH, JAMES. P C)	ROOF OF SERVICE

IN RE: CANVASS OF ABSENTEE AND MAIL-IN BALLOTS OF NOVEMBER 3, 2020 GENERAL ELECTION

COURT OF COMMON PLEAS PHILADELPHIA COUNTY

NOVEMBER TERM, 2020

No. 201100876

\_\_\_\_\_

# **ORDER**

AND NOW, to-wit, this 13th day of November, 2020, upon consideration of Petitioner Donald J. Trump for President, Inc.'s Notice of Appeal via Petition for Review of the Decision of the Philadelphia County Board of Elections, the response of the Philadelphia County Board of Elections and the submissions on behalf of Intervenors, DNA Services Corp./Democratic National Committee and the arguments of counsel, it appearing that Petitioner has properly and timely sought review of the decision of the Board of Elections pursuant to 25 Pa. C.S.A. §3146(g)(6), it further appearing that Petitioner is not contending that there has been fraud, that there is evidence of fraud or that the ballots in question were not filled out by the elector in whose name the ballot was issued, and it further appearing that Petitioner does not allege fraud or irregularity in the canvass and counting of the ballots, and the Court finding that the Intervenor's Objection to the consideration of the appeal as an "eligibility challenge" pursuant to 25 Pa. C.S.A. §3146.8 is a mischaracterization of the above-referenced review (and therefore a meritless objection), the Court finds as follows:

Petitioner asserts a challenge to the decision of the Board of Elections to count the
votes represented in the grouping designated Category 5, those being 533 ballots on
which the outer envelope contains the Elector's signature, the date and the elector's

- address filled out in the space provided but do not have the Elector's name printed under the signature.
- 2. The envelope provided to the elector from the Secretary of State of the Commonwealth contains a direction in the form of a checklist on the back of the envelope that directs the elector to sign the declaration, but makes no mention of filling out the date or other information.
- 3. The Election Code provides that a voter shall "fill out, date and sign the declaration" on the outer envelope.
- 4. The term "fill out" in the Code is not a defined term and is ambiguous.
- 5. The pre-printed ballot already contains the elector's name and address on the preprinted exterior envelope.
- 6. Neither a date nor the elector's filling out of the printed name or of the address are requirements necessary to prevent fraud.
- 7. The Petitioner concedes that all ballots by a qualified elector in this category were timely received.
- The Election Code directs the Court of Common Pleas in considering appeals from the County Board of Elections to make such decree as right and justice may require.
   Pa. C.S.A. §3157.

WHEREFORE, the Court ORDERS and DECREES that the Petition is **DENIED**. The Court further ORDERS AND DECREES that the decision of the Philadelphia County Board of Elections in canvassing and counting 533 absentee and mail-in ballots containing the elector's signature, hand-written address and date on the Declaration envelope but missing the hand-

printed name under the signature is AFFIRMED as in accordance with the provisions of the Election Code and the decisions of the Courts interpreting the Code.

BY THE COURT,

Crumlish, J.

# IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS OF PHILADELPHIA COUNTY PHINAS YEAR AND the Office of Judicial Records 14 NOV 2020 06:23 pm

IN RE: CANVASS OF ABSENTEE AND MAIL-IN BALLOTS OF NOVEMBER 3, 2020 GENERAL ELECTION

No. 201100876

November Term, 2020

# **NOTICE OF APPEAL**

Notice is hereby given that Donald J. Trump fo	r President, Inc.
Above named, hereby appeals to the:	
	☐ Superior Court
	☑ Commonwealth Court
	☐ Supreme Court
of Pennsylvania, from the Order entered in the	above case,
on the 13 <sup>th</sup> day of November, 2020.	

# Respectfully submitted,

### /s/ Linda A. Kerns

Linda A. Kerns, Esquire Law Offices of Linda A. Kerns, LLC Attorney ID 84495 1420 Locust Street, Suite 200 Philadelphia, PA 19102 T: 215-731-1413 lak@lindakernslaw.com

and

# /s/ Ronald L. Hicks, Jr.

Ronald L. Hicks, Jr. (PA #49520) Six PPG Place, Third Floor Pittsburgh, PA 15222 (412) 235-4500 (Telephone) (412) 235-4510 (Fax) rhicks@porterwright.com

Counsel for Plaintiff Donald J. Trump for President, Inc.



Temp. 06-2020

# Request for Transcript or Copy Philadelphia County

# Request Form must be emailed to: transcripts@courts.phila.gov

Pursuant to Pa.R.J.A. 4007(A), this form must be completed by any person requesting a transcript for any court proceeding. Additional requirements may be found in the local rules of court for each judicial district. Local rules may be found by following the appropriate link at: <a href="http://www.pacourts.us/courts-of-common-pleas/">http://www.pacourts.us/courts-of-common-pleas/</a>. If the cost of the transcript presents an economic hardship, there are reduced rates available to those who qualify. See Pa.R.J.A. 4007 (E). Copies of this request must be served in accordance with Pa.R.J.A. 4007(B). A deposit in the amount of 95% of the estimated cost of the transcript is required. All payments must be by check or money order payable to: "First Judicial District of Pennsylvania-Transcripts." No cash payments will be accepted. Direct payments to court reporters are not permitted.

In re Canvass of Absentee and Mail In Ballots of Nov 3 General	201100874/975/974/97	7/070	
Case Caption	Docket Number	201100874/875/876/877/878	
Crumlish	Traffic Court/Zoom		
Presiding Judge or Arraignment Court Magistrate	Courtroom		
November 13, 2020			
Date(s) of Proceeding	Co-Defendant docket # (I)	f applicable)	
Jennifer Venneri/jennifer.venneri@courts.phila.gov	**************************************		
Court Reporter Name (If available) Type of proceeding: (check the appropriate box)			
Type of proceeding: (check the appropriate box)			
Criminal Civil Family Orphans' Court Juvenile Other:	(specify) ELECTION LAW	MATTER	
Is this transcript request associated with an appeal? XYes No	Children's Fast Track	Yes No	
II. Requestor Information		33,000	
Does this request qualify for a reduced rate pursuant to Rule 4007(E)? Yes No f Yes, please provide proof of authorization for a reduced rate or an affidavit required by Rule 4008(E) sinda A. Kerns, Esquire/84495 lame of requestor/Attorney ID Number (if applicable) aw Offices of Linda A. Kerns, LLC gency/Firm	t)(4) requesting waiver of all or a poi	rtion of the costs.	
420 Locust Street, Suite 200, Philadelphia, PA 19102			
treet Address City	State	Zip	
nda@lindakernslaw.com 215-731-1400	215-701-4154		
mail Phone	Fax		
	f Digital Recording		
X Entire proceeding ☐ Jury Voir Dire ☐ Opening statements ☐ C.	osing arguments	Instructions	
Testimony (specify each witness):			
Pre/Post trial hearing (specify):			
Preliminary Arraignment Other (specify):			
V. Private Party Transcript Delivery and Cost		V SE THE PROPERTY OF	
for original transcript requests, please select from the following:		1 110	
11			
Dapedied Dapedied	Daily	Same Day	
toto page the page	\$6.00 per page	\$9.00 per pag	
	Hard Copy		
	al Time Streaming - \$250.00	per day	
pecial requests (if offered): Word Index ASCII	Other:		
re you requesting a copy of an existing transcript? Yes No (For Rates, p	olease see Phila.R.J.A. No. *	4008	
MM _	11.14.200		
	Date		
equestor's Mame			

Case ID: 201100876

IN RE: CANVASS OF ABSENTEE AND MAIL-IN BALLOTS OF NOVEMBER 3, 2020 GENERAL ELECTION

COURT OF COMMON PLEAS PHILADELPHIA COUNTY

**NOVEMBER TERM, 2020** 

No. 201100876

#### **ORDER**

AND NOW, to-wit, this 13th day of November, 2020, upon consideration of Petitioner Donald J. Trump for President, Inc.'s Notice of Appeal via Petition for Review of the Decision of the Philadelphia County Board of Elections, the response of the Philadelphia County Board of Elections and the submissions on behalf of Intervenors, DNA Services Corp./Democratic National Committee and the arguments of counsel, it appearing that Petitioner has properly and timely sought review of the decision of the Board of Elections pursuant to 25 Pa. C.S.A. §3146(g)(6), it further appearing that Petitioner is not contending that there has been fraud, that there is evidence of fraud or that the ballots in question were not filled out by the elector in whose name the ballot was issued, and it further appearing that Petitioner does not allege fraud or irregularity in the canvass and counting of the ballots, and the Court finding that the Intervenor's Objection to the consideration of the appeal as an "eligibility challenge" pursuant to 25 Pa. C.S.A. §3146.8 is a mischaracterization of the above-referenced review (and therefore a meritless objection), the Court finds as follows:

Petitioner asserts a challenge to the decision of the Board of Elections to count the
votes represented in the grouping designated Category 5, those being 533 ballots on
which the outer envelope contains the Elector's signature, the date and the elector's

- address filled out in the space provided but do not have the Elector's name printed under the signature.
- 2. The envelope provided to the elector from the Secretary of State of the Commonwealth contains a direction in the form of a checklist on the back of the envelope that directs the elector to sign the declaration, but makes no mention of filling out the date or other information.
- 3. The Election Code provides that a voter shall "fill out, date and sign the declaration" on the outer envelope.
- 4. The term "fill out" in the Code is not a defined term and is ambiguous.
- The pre-printed ballot already contains the elector's name and address on the preprinted exterior envelope.
- 6. Neither a date nor the elector's filling out of the printed name or of the address are requirements necessary to prevent fraud.
- 7. The Petitioner concedes that all ballots by a qualified elector in this category were timely received.
- The Election Code directs the Court of Common Pleas in considering appeals from the County Board of Elections to make such decree as right and justice may require.
   Pa. C.S.A. §3157.

WHEREFORE, the Court ORDERS and DECREES that the Petition is **DENIED**. The Court further ORDERS AND DECREES that the decision of the Philadelphia County Board of Elections in canvassing and counting 533 absentee and mail-in ballots containing the elector's signature, hand-written address and date on the Declaration envelope but missing the hand-

printed name under the signature is **AFFIRMED** as in accordance with the provisions of the Election Code and the decisions of the Courts interpreting the Code.

BY THE COURT,

Crumlish, J.

# IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS OF PHILADELPHIA COUNTY BEINGS

IN RE: CANVASS OF ABSENTEE AND MAIL-IN BALLOTS OF NOVEMBER 3, 2020 GENERAL ELECTION

No.

November Term, 2020

#### AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE

I, Linda A. Kerns, Esquire, hereby certify that I am this 14<sup>th</sup> day of November 2020 serving a true and correct copy of the Notice of Appeal together with the Order of Transcript, be electronic mail except where indicated and by the Court's electronic filing system, to the following:

Jennifer Venneri, Court Reporter Land Title Building, 100 South Broad Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19110 Jennifer.venneri@courts.phila.gov

Judge James Crumlish Philadelphia City Hall, Room 534 Philadelphia, PA 19107 Facsimile 215-686-7048 James.crumlish@courts.phila.gov

Facsimile

Danielle O'Connor, Deputy Court Administrator Court Reporters/Interpreters Land Title Bldg., 100 South Broad St., 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19110 Danielle.OConnor@courts.phila.gov

Benjamin H. Field Lydia Furst Affirmative and Special Litigation Unit City of Philadelphia Law Department 1515 Arch Street, 15th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102 benjamin.field@phila.gov Matthew Vahey Michael McDonald BALLARD SPAHR LLP 1735 MARKET ST 51ST FLOOR PHILADELPHIA PA 19103 vaheym@ballardspahr.com

Kahlil Williams 1735 MARKET ST 51ST FLOOR PHILADELPHIA PA 19103 williamskc@ballardspahr.com

Michele Hangley HANGLEY ARONCHICK SEGAL PUDLIN ONE LOGAN SQUARE 27TH FL PHILADELPHIA PA 19103 mhangley@hangley.com

John Coit 1245 LOMBARD STREET PHILADELPHIA PA 19147 JCOIT@HANGLEY.COM

# Respectfully submitted,

# /s/ Linda A. Kerns

Linda A. Kerns, Esquire Law Offices of Linda A. Kerns, LLC Attorney ID 84495 1420 Locust Street, Suite 200 Philadelphia, PA 19102 T: 215-731-1400 linda@lindakernslaw.com

and

#### /s/ Ronald L. Hicks, Jr.

Ronald L. Hicks, Jr. (PA #49520) Six PPG Place, Third Floor Pittsburgh, PA 15222 (412) 235-4500 (Telephone) (412) 235-4510 (Fax) rhicks@porterwright.com

Counsel for Plaintiff Donald J. Trump for President, Inc.