

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

CAROL ANN CARTER; MONICA PARRILLA;
REBECCA POYOUROWN; WILLIAM TUNG;
ROSEANNE MILAZZO; BURT SIEGEL; SUSAN
CASSANELLI; LEE CASSANELLI; LYNN WACHMAN;
MICHAEL GUTTMAN; MAYA FONKEU; BRADY
HILL; MARY ELLEN BALCHUNIS; TOM DEWALL;
STEPHANIE MCNULTY; & JANET TEMIN,

Petitioners

v.

7 MM 2022

LEIGH M. CHAPMAN, in her official capacity as the
Acting Secretary of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania;
JESSICA MATHIS, in her official capacity as Director for
the Pennsylvania Bureau of Election Services and Notaries,

Respondents

CONSOLIDATED WITH

PHILIP T. GRESSMAN; RON Y. DONAGI;
KRISTOPHER R. TAPP; PAMELA GORKIN; DAVID P.
MARSH; JAMES L. ROSENBERGER; AMY MYERS;
EUGENE BOMAN; GARY GORDON; LIZ MCMAHON,
TIMOTHY G. FEEMAN; & GARTH ISAAK,

Petitioners

v.

LEIGH M. CHAPMAN, in her capacity as Acting Secretary
of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; & JESSICA
MATHIS, in her capacity as Director for the Pennsylvania
Bureau of Election Services and Notaries,

Respondents

**Exceptions to Report of Special Master of Amici Khalif Ali, Maryn Formley,
Richard Rafferty, Patrick Beaty, Susan Gobreski, Barbara Hill, Judy Hines,
Jodi Greene, John Thompson, Cynthia Alvarado, and Timothy L. Kauffman**

Amici Khalif Ali *et al.* respectfully submit the following exceptions to the Report of the Special Master, dated February 7, 2022:

1. Amici take exception to, and this Court should decline to adopt, the Special Master's recommendation that HB 2146 be selected as Pennsylvania's new congressional plan.
2. Amici take exception to, and this Court should decline to adopt, the Special Master's legal conclusion that in an impasse case, courts owe any degree of deference to a congressional plan passed by the General Assembly but vetoed by the Governor.
3. Amici take exception to, and this Court should decline to adopt, factual findings or mixed factual findings and legal conclusions that underlie the Special Master's selection of HB 2146 and rejection of the Ali Plan, including:
 - a. Elimination from consideration of any plans that split the City of Pittsburgh or the County of Bucks;
 - b. A failure to take into account whether plans split the Capital Region or the urban centers of Northeastern Pennsylvania; and
 - c. Elimination from consideration, and non-prioritization, of the Ali Plan on the grounds that it is based on residence data treating prisoners as residents of their homes instead of their cells.

4. Amici take exception to, and this Court should decline to adopt, the Special Master's recommendation that the Ali Plan not be selected as Pennsylvania's new congressional plan.

Amici's accompanying brief more fully addresses the above exceptions and related errors.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Benjamin D. Geffen

Mary M. McKenzie, Bar No. 47434
Benjamin D. Geffen, Bar No. 310134
PUBLIC INTEREST LAW CENTER
1500 JFK Blvd., Suite 802
Philadelphia, PA 19102
mmckenzie@pubintl.org
267-546-1319
bgeffen@pubintl.org
267-546-1308

Martin J. Black, Bar No. 54319
Andrew M. Rocco, Bar No. 330751
DECHERT LLP
Cira Centre
2929 Arch Street
Philadelphia, PA 19104
martin.black@dechert.com
andrew.rocco@dechert.com
215-994-4000

Counsel for Amici Khalif Ali et al.

Suzanne R. Almeida, Bar No. 309558
COMMON CAUSE
800 N. 3rd Street, Suite 401
Harrisburg, PA 17102
salmeida@commoncause.org
717-232-9951

Counsel for Amicus Khalif Ali

Dated: February 14, 2022

CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE

I certify that this filing complies with the provisions of the Case Records Public Access Policy of the Unified Judicial System of Pennsylvania that require filing confidential information and documents differently than non-confidential information and documents.

/s/ Benjamin D. Geffen
Benjamin D. Geffen

Dated: February 14, 2022