## IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

League of Women Voters of Pennsylvania, : Carmen Febo San Miguel, James Solomon, : John Greiner, John Capowski, Gretchen : Brandt, Thomas Rentschler, Mary Elizabeth : Lawn, Lisa Isaacs, Don Lancaster, Jordi : Comas, Robert Smith, William Marx, : Richard Mantell, Priscilla McNulty, : Thomas Ulrich, Robert McKinstry, : Mark Lichty, Lorraine Petrosky, : Petitioners

٧.

: No. 261 M.D. 2017

The Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; The Pennsylvania General Assembly; Thomas W. Wolf, In His Capacity As Governor of Pennsylvania; Michael J. Stack III, In His Capacity As Lieutenant Governor of Pennsylvania And President of the Pennsylvania Senate; Michael C. Turzai, In His Capacity As Speaker of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives; Joseph B. Scarnati III, In His Capacity As Pennsylvania Senate President Pro Tempore; Robert Torres, In His Capacity As Acting Secretary of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; Jonathan M. Marks, In His Capacity As Commissioner of the Bureau of Commissions, Elections, and Legislation of the Pennsylvania Department of State, Respondents

## **ORDER**

NOW, this 7th day of December, 2017, upon consideration of petitioners' application to exclude portion of expert report of Dr. Gimpel and to

compel production of underlying information previously withheld on privilege grounds and upon consideration of legislative respondents' memorandum of law in opposition thereto, it is hereby ordered that, based upon the representations of legislative respondents' counsel that Dr. Gimpel did not rely upon information previously withheld on privilege grounds in forming his opinions and that legislative respondents produced underlying data to petitioners' counsel earlier today, petitioners' application is DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE to raise appropriate objections to Dr. Gimpel's testimony at trial or to cross-examine Dr. Gimpel on the bases for his opinions.

P. KEVIN BROBSON, Judge