

**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA  
MIDDLE DISTRICT**

No. 216 MM 2017

**SANDS BETHWORKS GAMING, LLC,**

**Petitioner**

**v.**

**PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE; C. DANIEL HASSELL  
IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS SECRETARY OF THE  
PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE; and THE  
PENNSYLVANIA GAMING CONTROL BOARD,**

**Respondents**

**RESPONDENTS' ANSWER TO THE PETITIONER'S APPLICATION  
FOR LEAVE TO FILE A POST-SUBMISSION COMMUNICATION**

JOSH SHAPIRO  
*Attorney General*

BY: ANTHONY THOMAS KOVALCHICK  
*Deputy Attorney General*

Office of Attorney General  
1251 Waterfront Place  
Mezzanine Level  
Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
Phone: (412) 565-2543  
FAX: (412) 565-3028

J. BART DELONE  
*Chief Deputy Attorney General*

KAREN M. ROMANO  
*Deputy Attorney General*

Date: August 7, 2018

**RESPONDENTS' ANSWER TO THE PETITIONER'S APPLICATION  
FOR LEAVE TO FILE A POST-SUBMISSION COMMUNICATION**

The Respondents, the Pennsylvania Department of Revenue, C. Daniel Hassell in his official capacity as the Secretary of the Pennsylvania Department of Revenue, and the Pennsylvania Gaming Control Board, through their undersigned counsel, respond to the Petitioner's Application for Leave to File a Post-Submission Communication as follows:

1. The averments contained in this numbered paragraph are admitted.
2. The averments contained in this numbered paragraph are admitted.
3. The averments contained in this numbered paragraph are admitted.
4. The averments contained in this numbered paragraph are admitted in

part and denied in part. In the brief that they filed on April 3, 2018, the Respondents stated that they would "voluntarily attempt to secure a refund for Sands and all similarly situated slot machine licensees if this Court determines that the challenged provisions of the Gaming Act are unconstitutional." Respondents' Brief at 22. That brief was filed roughly three months before the end of the relevant fiscal year. That fiscal year ended on June 30, 2018. Pending a decision by the Court in this action, and depending on the substance of that decision, the Gaming Control Board is statutorily obligated to distribute funds from the Casino Marketing and Capital Development Account ("CMCD Account") in accordance

with the applicable provisions of the Gaming Act. The Respondents, of course, will comply with any orders entered by the Court. The averments contained in this numbered paragraph are denied to the extent that they imply that the Respondents agreed not to distribute funds from the CMCD Account unless and until a decision is rendered in this case.

5. The averments contained in this numbered paragraph are admitted. By way of further information, the Respondents acknowledge the authenticity of the letter that the Petitioner has attached to its application.

6. The averments contained in this numbered paragraph are admitted in part and denied in part. Once distributions are made from the CMCD Account based on gross terminal revenue levels for the previous fiscal year, it may not be feasible for the Respondents to refund the supplemental daily assessment payments to the Petitioners for payments made during that fiscal year. If such distributions are made and the Court subsequently invalidates the statutory distribution scheme, the Respondents will still attempt to provide the Petitioners with refunds for supplemental daily assessment payments made during the fiscal year beginning on July 1, 2018.

7. The averments contained in this numbered paragraph are admitted. By way of further information, the Respondents agree that the Court should be made aware of their obligation to follow the statutory scheme, pending and

dependent upon the Court's decision in this case. The Respondents provided the Petitioners with notice of their intentions specifically because they believe that all relevant parties should be informed of the situation. The Respondents, of course, will comply with any orders entered by the Court.

WHEREFORE, the Respondents do not oppose the Petitioner's Application for Leave to File a Post-Submission Communication.

Respectfully submitted,

JOSH SHAPIRO  
Attorney General

By: /s/ Anthony Thomas Kovalchick  
ANTHONY THOMAS KOVALCHICK  
Deputy Attorney General  
Attorney I.D. #89056

J. BART DELONE  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Appellate Litigation Section

Office of Attorney General  
1251 Waterfront Place  
Mezzanine Level  
Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
[akovalchick@attorneygeneral.gov](mailto:akovalchick@attorneygeneral.gov)  
Phone: (412) 565-2543  
FAX: (412) 565-3028

KAREN M. ROMANO  
*Deputy Attorney General*

Date: August 7, 2018

**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA  
MIDDLE DISTRICT**

No. 216 MM 2017

**SANDS BETHWORKS GAMING, LLC,**

**Petitioner**

v.

**PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE; C. DANIEL HASSELL  
IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS SECRETARY OF THE  
PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE; and THE  
PENNSYLVANIA GAMING CONTROL BOARD,**

**Respondents**

**CERTIFICATION**

I certify that this filing complies with the provisions of the *Public Access Policy of the Unified Judicial System of Pennsylvania: Case Records of the Appellate and Trial Courts* that require filing confidential information and documents differently than non-confidential information and documents.

/s/ Anthony Thomas Kovalchick  
ANTHONY THOMAS KOVALCHICK  
Deputy Attorney General  
Attorney I.D. #89056

**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA  
MIDDLE DISTRICT**

No. 216 MM 2017

**SANDS BETHWORKS GAMING, LLC,**

**Petitioner**

**v.**

**PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE; C. DANIEL HASSELL  
IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS SECRETARY OF THE  
PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE; and THE  
PENNSYLVANIA GAMING CONTROL BOARD,**

**Respondents**

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that, on August 7, 2018, I caused a true and correct copy of the foregoing Respondents' Answer to the Petitioner's Application for Leave to File a Post-Submission Communication to be sent to the following:

**VIA ELECTRONIC FILING**

Timothy J. Lowry, Esquire  
Adam A. DeSipio, Esquire  
DLA PIPER LLP  
1650 Market Street, Suite 4900  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
[Adam.desipio@dlapiper.com](mailto:Adam.desipio@dlapiper.com)

Ilana Eisenstein, Esquire  
DLA Piper LLP  
1650 Market Street, Suite 2900  
Philadelphia, PA 19103

[Ilana.eisenstein@dlapiper.com](mailto:Ilana.eisenstein@dlapiper.com)

John J. Hamill, Esquire  
DLA Piper LLP  
444 West Lake Street, Suite 900  
Chicago, IL 60606-0089  
[John.hamill@dlpiper.com](mailto:John.hamill@dlpiper.com)

R. Douglas Sherman, Esquire  
Chief Counsel  
PA Gaming Control Board  
303 Walnut Street  
Commonwealth Tower, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Harrisburg, PA 17101-1803  
[rsherman@pa.gov](mailto:rsherman@pa.gov)

Karen M. Romano, Esquire  
Deputy Attorney General  
Office of Attorney General  
Civil Litigation Section  
15<sup>th</sup> Floor, Strawberry Square  
Harrisburg, PA 17120  
[kromano@attorneygeneral.gov](mailto:kromano@attorneygeneral.gov)

Mark Scott Stewart, Esquire  
Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC  
213 Market St. 8<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Harrisburg, PA 17101  
[mstewart@eckertseamans.com](mailto:mstewart@eckertseamans.com)

Kristine Evans Marsilio  
Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC  
213 Market St. 8<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Harrisburg, PA 17101  
[Kristine.e.robinson@gmail.com](mailto:Kristine.e.robinson@gmail.com)

Kevin M. Skjoldal  
Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC  
213 Market St. 8<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Harrisburg, PA 17101

[kskjoldal@eckertseamans.com](mailto:kskjoldal@eckertseamans.com)

/s/ Anthony Thomas Kovalchick  
ANTHONY THOMAS KOVALCHICK  
Deputy Attorney General  
Attorney I.D. #89056